



**Environment Panel
Green Street Police HQ:
Traffic and Parking Review hearing with the
Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources**

WEDNESDAY, 30th January 2013

Panel:

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman)
Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin
Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John

Witnesses:

Deputy E.J. Noel of St. Lawrence (The Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources)
Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police
Assistant Director, Property Holdings

Also present:

Scrutiny Officer

[14:32]

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman):

Welcome to this afternoon public hearing of the Environment Scrutiny Panel with myself as Chairman, John Young.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Sorry, I was just noticing the microphone problem. We are well covered. So you will need to, when you speak, just swing the microphone round to you to make sure we pick it up. Welcome to ladies and gentlemen, members of the public. We are going to talk about, this afternoon, the transport and car parking implications of the proposal to re-site the police headquarters on the open area at the rear of Green Street Car Park in La Route du Fort. This is, I think, the fifth such

session. Just to explain, we did previously have a session with the Minister for Home Affairs and there were a number of questions that related, if you like, to very much on-site and localised issues of how the building will be used and so on to help us determine its impact. As a result of that the Minister for Home Affairs thought a number of those questions were best put to yourselves as Property Holdings; that is both Deputy Noel and the Assistant Director, Property Holdings. Also we took advantage of the offer from the Deputy Police Chief, to come along and explain how the building will be used. We would like to start off, please, with the question of travel plans. Just to explain the context of this, when we met with the Minister for Planning and Environment and the Minister for Transport and Technical Services both of them told us that they saw this project as a very substantial one. The Minister for Planning and Environment in particular felt it was one to which the policy outlined under paragraph 8.88 of the Island Plan is that: "Travel plans should be submitted alongside planning applications which are likely to have significant transport implications." It is not our task today to look at the application but, because of the dependence on the travel plan, we wanted to hear from you what will be in those plans and how you think they will be enforceable, particularly with incentives and disincentives to make sure they are not just pieces of paper; that they really will influence people's travel behaviour. So would you like to, Assistant Minister, open up on that and explain what you have got in your proposals?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

To put it into context, back in March 2012 officers asked the Planning Department whether or not a travel plan would be required with the application. We were given the advice that it would not be required with the application but it would be a condition of the application prior to occupying the building. That has been reconfirmed to us in the last few days by the Planning Department.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Sorry to interrupt. Could I just ask who gave you that advice?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It was by the Planning Officer and also by the Chief Officer.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Chief Officer, Planning Department. Thank you.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It has been confirmed by them.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So when you said the last few days, can you elaborate and tell us who said what to you in the last few days?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We have had confirmation from the Chief Officer of Planning that it will be a condition but not required to determine the actual application.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Have you got a written communication on that?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can we see that?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We can provide it.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Excellent, thank you. Obviously what we shall be wanting to know is on what grounds the policy clearly set out in the Island Plan that says there will be such plans required as part of planning applications and that the Minister should have regard to the enforceability of the plan in deciding how much weight to give it in a planning decision ... we obviously want to know why it is felt that that is not the case.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

My understanding, Chairman, is that we have provided transport assessment information as part of our planning application that we submitted on 3rd August. My understanding, as we have not been asked for any more information and T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services) have commented on it as part of the application process, is that is enough for them to make a planning

application. The development of a workplace travel plan is very important and it is something that we will be doing. We will be doing it also because we aspire to establish BREEAM very good standard which does require work on travel plans as well.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Sorry, what was that standard again?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

BREEAM. It is the environmental standard of buildings. It is not strictly to do with transport. It is to do with the environmental credentials of the building and a travel plan is part of the BREEAM assessment process. So we are committed to do that. We have made a start in terms of doing a framework document that we have discussed with T.T.S. There are meetings happening this week but it is something we will substantially do when we know we can develop the building, which is when we get the planning application in.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Will you be able to show us this framework document?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I do not see why not. It is literally filling out some headers at the moment, but we will be taking on some specialist advice to progress that at the appropriate time.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Just looking at the paper you submitted, I assume you are referring to the Arup document dated 2nd August?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

On workplace travel plan, it says: "The police will develop an appropriate travel plan with the aim of maintaining a high proportion of non-car travel to and from work and it will include a set of mechanisms and initiatives to encourage travel behaviours such as walking, cycling, use of public transport and car sharing. The building will include showers and changing rooms which will encourage ..." The sustainable transport policy, which the Minister told us this policy is designed to enforce, talks about incentives and disincentives. Are there any practical measures that are under consideration to make sure that you can in fact deliver the reduced car dependence of commuting to work?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Already the police as a workforce are a lot less car-hungry users than a typical occupier of office accommodation. The typical usage of an office block is something like 78 per cent of users would travel to and from their workplace by car. From a survey that was carried out in October 2011, if my memory serves me correctly, in the police force some 39 per cent (almost half the normal standard) travel by car. So the police are already in a very good position. The majority of their workforce do not use a car to come to and from work, but obviously there is always room for improvement and we will be keen, when we discuss the travel plan with the users (i.e. the members of the force), to see whether that 39 per cent can be reduced even further.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can we just explore that a little bit? That survey, presumably, is based around the current headquarters at Summerland and Rouge Bouillon, is it?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It is based on the comments of staff.

Deputy J.H. Young:

How many car-parking spaces in practice are available in that immediate locality for police to use?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

There are currently 20 spaces available in Roussel Street, which is effectively at the back of the ambulance station. Those are allocated on a first-come/first-served basis for a number of emergency services workers, including ambulance and fire as well who are also based in that locality. The spaces are available to staff who travel over 2 miles and, again, permits are issued to those individuals who are able to take advantage of those spaces should they be available. But there are only 20 spaces available all told for that particular locality. Otherwise staff make their own arrangements, mainly through private car-parking arrangements with local owners.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Could you tell us a bit more about that?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I cannot really tell you where the ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

People make them privately, do they?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes, they do.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Individual officers ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes, individual officers on the staff.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But the police force do not make arrangements for any other ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No, it is done on an individual basis. People take out a rental space or something like that in their own right.

The Connétable of St. John:

Will this happen when you go to Green Street in the same way?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

You are not going to be finding parking spaces for 40 vehicles, for instance, on any specific site other than that we have already got identified here?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Well, Connétable, as you know, we have been approached by a land owner in the area who has offered 40 spaces to our police staff. If we get planning permission we will take that inquiry further and if those spaces are available they will be offered to police staff to take them up in their own name and pay for it themselves, as they currently do.

The Connétable of St. John:

The site is located where?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I cannot tell you. As you know, we have already published the letter from the land owner. They wish the site to remain private at the moment.

The Connétable of St. John:

I appreciate that, but can you give us an indication of how far away it is from the station?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We already have in the written answer that was given to all States Members in November. It is within 100 metres of the site.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Could I go back a couple of stages, please, Assistant Minister. Talking about the private car-parking arrangements that you have at the moment, do you have any idea how many of your officers take up the private car-parking arrangements?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

I can probably get the details for you. I cannot tell you off the top of my head at the moment.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

The reason for the question is do you have any indication as to how many of those private car-park spaces will be retained if the police station moves to Green Street?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

I think the assessment told us that some officers and members of staff would retain their existing arrangements, but if we get approval to relocate to the Green Street site then some may review that or look at alternative travel plans using public transport, car sharing or move on to cycles or walking dependent on that. So some would be retained but I could not give you a definitive figure for that.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Going back to the 40 spaces, is that an existing car park? Is there a change of use involved with that proposal?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I am not going to give any details at this time because I do not want to breach the confidence that we have with the land owner by making that site identified at this moment in time.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The reason why I ask is because one of the things the panel has got to do in all these matters is to express opinion on the reliability and the evidence and obviously at the moment you are not giving us much evidence to help support that.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Well, we have published a redacted version of the letter of offer that we have had.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can you pass a copy to me now? I apologise, but I have not seen it.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes. It was in answer to a States Member's question on 20th November and it will be published. Perhaps you can find it.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But you are not able to tell us whether it already is a car park or whether it is something else for which a change of use would be required?

[14:45]

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I am not going to say anything that identifies where that location is because we have given an undertaking.

Deputy J.H. Young:

You are saying that if that were taken up then individual officers would have to individually take that up, would they?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes, it would not be met by public expense.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

The cost would not be met by public expense.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes, but would there be a head lease or some kind of arrangement that the property owner would have to go into?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We have not explored that with the land owner because if we do not get planning permission it would be a futile exercise.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I understand that, but I am trying to ascertain whether or not this is going to be a proposal where one can guarantee, if you like, there will be 40 spaces or whether or not individual police officers will have to take up options individually.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

There are other options in the area generally. I mean there are, of course, some housing estates that tend to rent out spaces, although there are not a huge amount of those spaces. There is a private car park further down Green Street that is another opportunity. So there are other opportunities in the area.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Sorry, the private car park in Green Street?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

There is one down the far end of Green Street towards Havre des Pas, on the left-hand side by the arcade of shops. It is run by a hotel, I believe.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is there? There is space available there?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I have not researched that myself. I was told by somebody that there were spaces for rent there but I have not checked that.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Right, individuals. So police officers might be able to rent spaces there on a private basis?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes, absolutely.

Deputy J.H. Young:

You said about housing estates. Could you explain that a bit more? What did you mean by that?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

The Housing Department do rent out private car-parking spaces but that is dependent on the pressure from their own residents.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What residential blocks have you got in mind in that area?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Well, I have not got any in mind. The ones that exist in that area: there is La Collette, which is currently being refurbished. That certainly is one and there are one or 2 others probably more up Roseville Street area. But, because we are, with a fair wind, 3 years from opening the building, we have not gone into detailed discussions with anyone because there is a lot to happen.

Deputy J.H. Young:

La Collette, that is right down the bottom of Green Street.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

It is, yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What is the other one?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

The Cedars is very close but I do not think there is a great detail of parking there and there are also some others in ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

No, I agree with you. We went on a site visit yesterday.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Of course, you have seen it yourself. Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I certainly did not form the view that there was space at the Cedars. The third one?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I believe there is a development at Roseville Street and I cannot remember its name now. I am sorry. I have got an email somewhere.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I wonder if we can just go back to the survey a minute, because obviously that is important. You told us the survey was in October 2011.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

That is correct.

Deputy J.H. Young:

This was a survey of all serving police staff, was it?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

All staff, police officers and police staff. Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What percentage return did you get from the questionnaires?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

We had 181 responses.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Out of how many?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Out of 330.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

330, yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So 181 out of 330 and, of the 181, 39 per cent currently travel by car?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

They make either private arrangements or park in the 20 spaces?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But you ration those 20 spaces to those who live over 2 miles away.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is that only serving police officers because they are under discipline or is it civil servants and what have you to enforce such a requirement?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I think that is all staff.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Including the fire and ambulance staff as well.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Can I ask, Assistant Minister, the figure of 20 people that use the Roussel Street car park at the present time, did that number come out of the 181 responses?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No, there are physically 20 spaces in that car park and they are utilised on a first-come/first-served basis by all three of the uniformed services: the ambulance, fire and police.

Deputy J.H. Young:

In that survey, did you ask them what they would do if they were to be relocated next to a public car park?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

We asked a range of questions. I do not have the questionnaire details with me, I do not think. I have to find out.

Deputy J.H. Young:

That is okay. What we would very much like to see, if it were possible, is a copy of the questionnaire and the results, please.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Can I go back to an early part of the meeting at about 2.35 p.m. when we raised the issue about 8.88? I will read it out: "The Minister for Planning and Environment considered that travel plans should be submitted alongside planning applications which are likely to have significant transport implications including: (1) residential developments with more than 50 units of accommodation; (2) other developments comprising jobs, shopping, leisure and services which would generate a significant amount of travel - this in particular applies to offices over 2,500m² and retail over 800m² development; (3) new and expanded school facilities, which should be accompanied by a school travel plan; and (4) where the travel plan would help to address a particular local traffic problem associated with the planning application ..." That being the case, Minister, you are telling the panel that Property Holdings and the Minister for Planning and Environment have got together to get around the Island Plan, which has only been in operation for a couple of years or less than that. So virtually you are driving a cart and horses through legislation that everybody else in the Island has to comply with and yet, because you are a States department, you are going to be allowed to get away with it?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

The quick answer to that, Constable, is no. If I elaborate on that, in March 2012 we contacted the Planning Department to ask would they require a travel plan to be submitted with the application. We were advised that, no, we would not but we would have to have one as a condition of any planning consent given and it would have to be completed and in force prior to occupation of the building. Since last week's meeting with the Minister for Planning and Environment where he indicated that he may require a travel plan to be able to determine the planning application, we clarified the situation with his department and they have confirmed to us that a travel plan will be required, as they previously advised, prior to us occupying the building and would only be required if planning consent in principle is given.

The Connétable of St. John:

So "may be required", that was the Minister's words, but the officers have told you something different? Is that what you are saying?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

The officers have told us that we do not require a travel plan to accompany the application so that the Minister can determine it. They advised us ...

The Connétable of St. John:

So they are at variance with ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Could I finish? They have advised us that it is not a requirement to be with the application in order for the Minister to be able to determine the application, but it will be a requirement of any consent.

The Connétable of St. John:

So they are at variance with their Minister's comments to you last week.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I cannot ...

The Connétable of St. John:

You have told me both sides of the story. So do you not agree they are at variance with their own Minister?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I do not know if they are at variance or if there is some type of misunderstanding between their Minister and his department.

The Connétable of St. John:

I see. You have obviously read the Island Plan and the relevant 8.88, Minister. Would you agree that, if we go down the road of what the officers are telling you, you are having preferential treatment to anyone else in the Island?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I would refer you to policy TT9 which sets out what the actual policy is and I believe that this development does not have a significant impact that would require it to have a travel plan to be part of the application.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Really? Can I just clear that up? You consider that this proposal does not have a significant impact?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

That requires a travel plan to be part of the application. I do agree that a travel plan needs to be produced.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I am grateful for that clarification because I am referring here to some documents that were part of the application (this is dated September 2011) at the time when various options were being considered. This is, I think, your own document and it says: "The site is situated in a defined built-up area of the Island Plan and meets the strategic objectives of meeting the Island's development in the urban area. It presently contributes towards part of the off-street public car-parking provision for the town and evidently discussions with the highway authority about the impact of this site on the overall level of public parking provision are critical." That is your own evaluation in September 2011.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

That is exactly what happened. That is part of the concept options review document and we have been having those discussions since then.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So you knew it was critical?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

We knew that those discussions were critical. The scheme has gone through a number of levels. It went through concept. It went through feasibility and then it went through design process to planning. Through the process of establishing feasibility there were critical conversations to have with T.T.S. officers about the whole issue of the car parking and utilising that area of the car park and those things happened.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Chairman, let me be clear. We believe that travel plan is necessary. It does need to be produced, but it does not need to be produced at the same time as the application is determined. It is not just a document because it is a living document. It is going to be a working document that is produced site-specific after the planning application has been granted and it will be in force prior to the building being occupied.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Could I just ask, if that is the situation, if it turns out that a planning obligation agreement is necessary to secure the things in the transport plan, how would it be possible to reach that agreement subsequent to deciding an application?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It is quite straightforward, I would have thought. A planning obligation is a matter of a negotiation between the Planning Department and the applicant.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Prior to consent.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Not necessarily prior to consent.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Well, that is normally the situation, is it not?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No, consent can be conditional upon agreeing ...

Deputy J.H. Young:

So conditional consent and on agreeing a planning obligation agreement?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

In that case, until the planning obligation agreement is entered into there is no consent. You would accept that?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes, you could have a conditional approval.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Thank you for that. I think you have ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We have said all along that a travel plan will be a condition of any planning application consent.

Deputy J.H. Young:

When will we see a transport plan? Can you give us a date?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Just take a step back. We are the applicant here. We have made a planning application to the Planning Department and we have followed their advice. We have provided transport assessment information. They have assessed that and they are currently in the process of determining the application. That is point 1. Point 2 is that our understanding is that a workplace plan, which is an important aspect of us moving forward, will need to be developed and it will need to be in place and agreed (and I understand this is with T.T.S. as well as Planning) by the time we occupy the building. I have not seen a condition yet but that is where we are. We need to start that process. You talked earlier about incentives and things and you were effectively asking how we could make these things stick. We start the process because, assuming we get the planning certificate, we go into detailed design and the first thing we need to do is make sure the facilities support different ways of travelling. We think we are doing that. We have got the showers. We have got all the things but we will continue to do that forward. Then it will be around incentives. Now, we have not done that detailed work yet. T.T.S. have got a transport plan and incentives are around having a staff bicycle fleet, reviewing the use of the fleet, reviewing the nature of free parking in some buildings as to whether that would change behaviour. There is a whole raft of things you can do. It obviously depends on the site and the nature of the workforce and that is a process we have to go through.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Perhaps I will move to the Deputy Chief Officer now, if that is all right, Assistant Minister. Enforceability of these travel plans, obviously they are your staff. Can you reassure the panel about how you can make that plan stick when it is introduced and how you can make sure that it is not just a piece of paper?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Well, it is a very important document. I take your point. It is not an enforceable document as such. It has to be done by persuasion, negotiation and putting incentives in place and that is the work we need to do. We cannot mandate that people follow it but we can do whatever we can to encourage people to change their behaviours.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But will you consider offering incentives and disincentives and so on?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

We would have to look at that to see what we could do within the confines of the plan and the opportunities that present to us. Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Thank you for that. If I could perhaps move to the plan, I think T.T.S. have told us the number on the impact. I think it is 91 spaces lost. The papers that we have got, that you have just referred us to, provisions needs to be recognised that there will be an impact of 65 commuter members of staff parking in the Green Street car park out of the ... I think it is 330 we were told. Is that right?

[15:00]

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, around 330. It does fluctuate slightly.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Would I be right that the 65 is based on the 39 per cent of your travel survey?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, it is. The figures were extrapolated from our survey.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So you are assuming that that level is achieved for the 65. Could I just develop about when this impact will occur? It was suggested the other day that the majority of around 220 members of staff would be arriving at 7.00 a.m. and leaving at 5.00 p.m., although the Minister for Home Affairs told us it was not quite that. There were variations of shift that means that some of those people would arrive at different times, but this is quite important to the panel because we know that Green Street Car Park is full by just after 8.00 a.m. Can you tell us any more information about the shift pattern and the numbers coming, particularly in the morning, and the time of leaving as well when they will be out of that car park?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes. There are a number of dimensions really to the way in which the organisation works. Primarily the uniforms on shifts provide 24-hour cover and they work predominantly days, lates and nights, but the shift patterns around those do vary. A day shift does start at 7.00 a.m. and runs through to 5.00 p.m. A night shift would run from 9.00 p.m. to 7.00 a.m. and in the middle we have got the late shift. There are some variations around that but ordinarily that would be between 2.00 p.m. and 10.00 p.m., but at weekends, Fridays and Saturdays that is, that 2.00 p.m. and 10.00 p.m. varies to either 5.00 p.m. or a 3.00 a.m. or a 4.00 p.m. to 12.00 midnight. So there are some overlaps there. There are designed to be overlaps at weekends particularly to get that additional cover. That would involve about 25 officers on that overlap of about 2 to 3 hours. So

that is the core of the uniformed shifts. That is supported by some much smaller teams in terms of custody, an investigation unit and the force control room and we are talking there at most 8 to 10 people. Again, their core hours vary during that middle day structure but they do start at 7.00 a.m. So the core hours of operational policing are really between 7.00 a.m. and 6.00 p.m. In addition to that we have a crime services team and all the specialist support they provide and, again, that is mainly core activity between about 8.00 a.m. and 6.00 p.m. There are a smaller number that work outside of that, but we are talking probably less than 10 individuals beyond 6.00 p.m. - 6.00 p.m. to midnight or something like that. Then the Criminal Justice Department, there is about 30 people. They work core office hours, 8.00 a.m. to 6.00 p.m. or something like that. Then there are a number of people in support services - I.T. (information technology), planning and chief officers if you like - and they would work between 7.00 a.m. and 6.00 p.m. So the core hours really are somewhere 7.00 a.m. and 5.00 p.m. and 8.00 a.m. and 6.00 p.m. and around that you have the shift officers working. So there are overlaps between the various day and night shifts and that core activity in the centre.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Well, thank you for that very helpful information. That is very helpful. If we take the impact of 65 people parking, do you think it is right that the majority of that impact would be in the 7.00 a.m. group and the others would be in the minority?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, they would be.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Would you accept it is probably likely then that that 65 will take priority for space at Green Street in the car park?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Well, wherever. That would be one of the car parks they could use, yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The evidence indicates to us that it is used for overnight parking for residents and there is space available, we believe, for overnight residents. What we are not sure of is what time people empty out of it, when they go to work, because from what we have been told there is a shortage of car-parking spaces for residents in that area. So weekends and overnight it is clearly used for residents.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes. Weekends and overnight there is around 400 spaces every night of the week and at weekends. It predominantly, as you know, is a commuter car park. It tends to fill up by about 8.30 a.m. and it tends to start to empty by 2.30 p.m. On any working day there is in excess of 100 spaces by 3.00 p.m. in Green Street.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Yes, we have been told that but we were also told that that afternoon gap at Green Street, if I can call it that, does provide a usable function for shoppers because Snow Hill by that time has got a queue. So Snow Hill, which is predominantly a shoppers' car park, generally people turning up would have to sit in a queue.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

But what does not happen is that Green Street does not fill up again. It continues emptying from being full at 2.30 p.m. to having its 400 spaces overnight until 8.30 a.m. the following morning.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But those that cannot get in there, if I can put it that way, what would be your expectation of what car parks staff would use if they turn up at Green Street and cannot get in?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

There is some capacity in the Pier Road site, which is a little over half a mile away. There is always about 250 spaces there. But, again going back to the transport plan, we encourage people to look at their transport habits; either use public transport, car share or change their mode of transport to cycling or something like that.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Do officers travel to work in uniform or do they change?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

A few will but primarily they will change into uniform at work.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So there will be no downside to them parking elsewhere and walking distances in the rain and so on? That is not a problem?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

There are extensive changing facilities and lockers and things in the scheme design.

Deputy J.H. Young:

There is sufficient in your specification for everybody; it is not just a token provision?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, there is sufficient.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No. Goodness me, it is an operational necessity.

The Connétable of St. John:

So every department of the States police force will be down at the new headquarters?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, located on the one site.

The Connétable of St. John:

Every department?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Including the Joint Financial Crimes Unit?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Customs and police; so you will have both in the building at once?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Can we now talk about motorcycle parking provision? Within the plan I see that in the proposal are 2 elements: motorcycle spaces in Snow Hill (incidentally, also we understand that the provision of visitor parking to police headquarters is to be located in Snow Hill) and 38 motorcycle spaces in what is presently a bus layby, changed a bit, on La Route du Fort. We had a site visit yesterday. Is it your preference that the motorcycle provision goes immediately opposite the new headquarters on that site? Is that your preference?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Following advice with our colleagues at T.T.S., that is our preference. But obviously if that, for whatever reason, is not available then there are alternatives.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So there would be no operational reason why that could not go somewhere else?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

That was the site that was suggested to us by T.T.S., is my understanding. It is very convenient to the new headquarters building using available land.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We wondered whether it was necessary for visibility since it is immediately opposite the windows of the police headquarters. That is not necessary?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No. I mean it is helpful to have it there in terms of security of the cycles and motorcycles, but that could be dealt with by way of CCTV or something like that.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Have you considered any other options for motorcycles or visitor parking to the proposed police station yourself or have you relied on T.T.S. to come up with the proposals?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We are open to other solutions apart from the solution that has been suggested.

The Connétable of St. John:

You did say a second ago that there were alternatives. Could you tell us what the alternatives are?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

There are some alternative spaces at the entrance to Green Street Car Park where we envisage we will be able to make some ...

The Connétable of St. John:

The entrance; which end, on the north end or the ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

On the north end where we will be able to create some parking for motorcycles.

The Connétable of St. John:

I have to challenge you there. Can you tell me where because you, being a motorcyclist like myself, use it occasionally and it is always full. So where would that be?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

There are 2 possible sites there. One site is currently in the ownership of the parish and the other site is part of the car park area itself.

The Connétable of St. John:

So you would be losing car-parking spaces?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No, it is a landscaped area currently.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Can I just elaborate on that? We did this. T.T.S. officers and we reviewed a number of areas around the area. We reviewed the front part of Green Street Car Park where currently there is like a V-shape just in front of there. It is difficult there because levels are quite difficult and you are potentially mixing with pedestrians and things like that. So we have looked at some provision in Snow Hill where we think we can provide some without losing any car-parking spaces. We have talking to the parish about providing some cycle spaces in and around the cemetery. We talked to the parish about their proposals to develop the toilet and whether there is any scope there. Having gone through that process, we put forward this as our solution and that is the thing we put into the planning and we are expecting a response on that in terms of acceptability.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We noticed yesterday a number of things. We noticed that the area chosen is very close to a residential area below the wall. I think it is called Runnymede Court or something.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes, that is correct.

Deputy J.H. Young:

There are a lot of houses down there whose bedrooms windows very much face that area and, particularly thinking of comings and goings at night and so on, we thought that was an issue. We wonder whether those motorcycles could be relocated anywhere else.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Bearing in mind we have been asked to provide the spaces to cover for the amount of people that we are aware travel on cycles and motorcycles within the States of Jersey police, we wanted to provide somewhere quite close to the station. One thing I will say about that, we are aware of issues with Runnymede Court. There were clearly some objections from some of those neighbours as part of the planning process. What we have not done yet is develop details of landscaping and a sort of screening proposal for that area. That would be done as part of the next stage should we get planning permission for that.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So your alternative is screening. We also looked at the proposed visitor parking arrangements. Could I check; I assume this is daytime visitors, is it? I understand that police headquarters is not available to night-time visitors now. Is that right?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No, the inquiry desk at the existing police station closes in the evening now. It is still available. There is still staff there.

Deputy J.H. Young:

What about Green Street? What is going to happen there?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

There is a pilot we are running at the moment to see whether it is a viable proposition but we will carry that forward to the new headquarters.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We certainly noticed a queue of vehicles going into Snow Hill. People were queuing up for shopping parking and we certainly had evidence that it is a very important car park for shopping. We saw the spaces that you have got aligned but we did wonder how those spaces are going to be reserved and enforced for visitors to the police headquarters if there is already an over-demand on that area.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Just for information, what time of day was your visit?

Deputy J.H. Young:

We visited it just after 2.00 p.m.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

The other issue of course is that if there is queue of traffic waiting to get into Snow Hill Car Park and you have allocated 2 or 3 spaces alongside the traffic, it is very difficult to access it. It is difficult to turn a car around to leave. Given the visibility aspect of the proposed motorcycle parking opposite the police station that we were just talking, we wondered if you considered using that space for visitor parking and allocating the entrance to Snow Hill Car Park as motorcycle parking, which would be a lot easier to allocate.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

We started there, Steve. When we developed the plan we started with: "Could we put visitor spaces on that area?" It is difficult to do. Because it is on to a main road we were advised that you have to drive in and out, which means there is not the room to provide car parking. You cannot just put them at an angle and have people reversing out on to the main road. We have looked at that as a proposal. In fact we started there when we started developing the scheme. It does not work.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It would work if you only allowed access coming from east to west into that parking area. If somebody was visiting the police station coming from the west they would have to somehow turn around along Rue Du Fort to come back the other way, because you could not have them crossing lanes at that particular point.

[15:15]

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

But there is not enough room. That is the problem.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So what we should do is talk to T.T.S. about that. Is that what you are saying?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

We did talk to T.T.S. about it. I am sure we did and certainly our traffic engineer looked at it.¹

Deputy J.H. Young:

We noticed a number of things. Firstly we noticed that the buses do not go in the layby, the westward facing buses. They drop people at the traffic lights.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

They do not like going in the layby because they have to cross 2 lanes of traffic.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We also noticed you are going to have to lose a few trees, which is a shame, particularly next door to The Limes.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Well, landscaping has to be agreed and that is certainly an issue.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We have got concerns about the impact on The Limes. We also noticed that if visitors to the police headquarters did park in Snow Hill they would have to cross that very nasty junction - crossing Grenville Street, I think it is, there - with 2 lanes of fast-moving traffic around a corner. T.T.S. told us that that corner is too dangerous to put a crossing because there is no visibility. People would not be seen. So it strikes us there are quite a number of hurdles for somebody turning up wanting to go to police headquarters, pre-stressed, maybe even in the dark, having to park their car there, walk along, cross that road, et cetera. If parking could be provided more conveniently opposite the building, if we are going to lose the bus layby, it strikes us as being better.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Chairman, the reason I asked the time of your visit was because before 8.30 a.m. and after 2.30 p.m. visitors to the police station will be able to park in Green Street Car Park because there is still

¹ It was subsequently confirmed to the Panel that this was not formally discussed with TTS nor were any formal drawings produced.

going to be pedestrian access from Green Street Car Park to La Route du Fort. So the spaces required for visitor parking are only really required between 8.30 a.m., which is why ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Sorry, can you just reiterate that? The pedestrian access that exists at the moment from Green Street Car Park on to La Route du Fort is going to remain in place?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes. So visitor parking's pinch point is between the hours of 8.30 a.m. and 2.30 p.m., which is why we are looking for alternatives outside of Green Street Car Park. We are open to discussions with T.T.S. and if we need to we will explore with them providing an additional visitor car park in Green Street itself.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I was going to say if the access from Green Street Car Park to La Route du Fort is being maintained, have you explored the option with T.T.S. of motorcycle parking inside the car park?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Again, we can do. The problem is that again it reduces the number of car-parking spaces in Green Street.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Just as a footnote to this, you may recall from the interim response the Minister made to the other Scrutiny Panel's report about the building, we have accepted the need to review the visitor parking arrangements. We have accepted that. If there are other suggestions then we will work them into that review. We do not see it as a reason to hold up the scheme but we have accepted the need to review that aspect of the scheme.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Although we did hear from T.T.S. that if the scheme goes ahead there are going to have to be changes to the pavements and so on and narrowing the road in an easterly direction which will have impact on buses and so on. So there would need to be a redesign of that area to meet that need. What we have got is a plan at the moment which narrows the pavements, has one lane going east of the main traffic where the buses stop but has 2 lanes on the other side of the road and loses a bus bay. If you start changing these things as you have said, one would have to have a look at the layout as a whole.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Well, we would. The current position, as I understand it, is that, subject to a few more detailed drawings, T.T.S. are relatively comfortable with the layout we have put together. Obviously if we change them then that will have to be done holistically and T.T.S. will have to be involved in that process.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Now, can I change the subject very completely? We may come back to that. My colleagues have other points. One of the things that is often said by members of the public and as a layman one understands it, obviously in an ideal world we would have had 2 tunnels, but we have not. We have got one. The tunnel gets blocked and everybody knows that when you are on the west and you want to go east there are alternative routes. Whereas when you are on the east and you want to go west and the tunnel is blocked there is not. What is your response to that?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Chairman, firstly there are alternatives. If you are coming east and you want to go west and the tunnel is blocked I can name 2 alternatives. You can go round La Collette way or you can go up Green Street and down Hill Street. No matter which side of the tunnel you are on and it is blocked, there are alternative routes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So Green Street over Mount Bingham; is that what you are saying?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Those are 2 alternative routes.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But Green Street has got a narrow chicane. It is a traffic management route, is it not, for reasons of ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No, you stated that if the tunnel was blocked there was no other route to go east to west when in fact there are.

Deputy J.H. Young:

But would that not be creating conflict if a police vehicle had to go fast down Green Street, through that chicane over Mount Bingham? Does that not open up matters?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

As you know, Deputy, the majority of police vehicles do not exit on blue light from the police station.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I was inviting you to lay out your position on that for us.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

The nature of deploying of police vehicles is somewhat different to other emergency services where fire services and, to a lesser extent, ambulance do deploy from their own space, as it were. Policing is not quite like that because our officers will be out on patrol. They will be in motor car, motorbike, cycle, foot, whatever it is. We try to cover the Island as best we can in terms of those allocated patrols and officers are deployed to incidents as they occur from wherever they are based. We do not deploy from the police stations as such. They will be periodically where specialist support, may be a scientific support vehicle or something like that, would go out to help officers at the scene of a burglary or whatever and they would come from the police headquarters. But by far the majority of deployments would be from wherever the officers are located at a given time.

The Connétable of St. John:

I accept what you are saying and you are repeating what was said by the Minister for Home Affairs, which is gratifying. Could I just move slightly across? You are having 3 disabled bays which are going to be shared with delivery vehicles.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes.

The Connétable of St. John:

Given a disabled person takes X amount of time longer than an able-bodied person because of the nature of the disability, is it wise to have service vehicles on the same spot as a disabled people?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

From memory, the pull in from the roadway is for disabled visitors. It would be sort of barrier controlled and they can come along and press a button and be allowed into that secured layby, as it were. So they can park there safely and go into the police station entrance which is across from that. Deliveries to and from the police station for its supplies and whatever, that will be dealt with by way of appointment. We would have to negotiate this with our suppliers who can be dealt with out of hours by appointment to that site or indeed it could be delivered to a different location where

we are looking to put some of our over-sized vehicles. We could have the main deliveries taken there and we could bring them back ourselves from that location.

The Connétable of St. John:

I want to come on to visibility. Will you tell me whether or not the building is going to be designed with 100 per cent access for anybody who is disabled whether he is an employer, whether he is somebody to be interviewed, somebody going to give evidence, et cetera, or maybe even a visiting advocate - whether it is from the cells right the way through to the top of the building with 100 per cent access - or is it going to be a suck-it-and-see scenario where it will follow some project, as happens in the U.K. (United Kingdom) and other places where there is a minimum standard?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No, it fully complies from the access to all aspects of the building. From street level to the roof is fully disabled compliant. That is by way of lift facilities, wider doorways, lower handles and the toilet facilities. It is fully compliant.

The Connétable of St. John:

Right down into the cells and all, if you have disabled person in the cells for any reason? Hopefully not, but it does happen. They will have disabled facilities within the cells?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

We will have a specialist facility there.

The Connétable of St. John:

I know we are here for traffic but I just wanted to make sure while we are at it. Also it was raised that the building obviously it has got blast walls. Because of terrorism, et cetera, given its locality to Green Street Car Park, are we going to be losing car-parking spaces within Green Street Car Park because it is a certain distance away from police headquarters? Historically it is known obviously car bombs are the way terrorists seem to work. God forbid that it ever happens in Jersey but anything is likely. What are you putting in place in the car park (obviously we know about the blast walls) to protect any travelling public because of its proximity to the ...

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No other spaces apart from the 91 that have already been identified are due to be lost. As we have already said, because the external staircase is going to be moved within the car park, there are no spaces lost apart from that 91. The new police building itself will be built to the required specification to protect it from any attempt by a vehicle device being placed along that northern wall.

The Connétable of St. John:

The other walls also, I presume.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

The whole of the basement and floor area is protected by a blast wall. The whole of the back wall adjacent to the car park is a blast wall all the way through to the top and there are other provisions within the construct of the building which provide other security measures to resist blasts.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

If we could get back to travel and transport we would be grateful. Assistant Minister, we have spoken about deliveries. How many deliveries do you normally get in the course of a day at the police station?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I do not know the answer to that myself but I am sure the Deputy Chief Officer will be able to enlighten you.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

I do not know. Do you know?

Male speaker:

Three or 4.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Three or 4, there we are.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

The types of products that are being delivered?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Mainly stationery, occasionally furniture.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Do you have any evidence to show how many disabled visitors you get to the police station during the course of a normal week?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No. It is very few. Very few indeed.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Do you have any disabled members of staff at the moment?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, we do.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

How many is that?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Four or 5 and, of course, our existing buildings are not compliant at all.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We assume that the new buildings will be completely compliant.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Yes, they will. We have just been told.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Absolutely.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

If I could have just a couple of minutes I would like to go back to the travel plan and put this to the Assistant Minister. Last week in a hearing the Manager of Transport at T.T.S. said to us that a travel plan is just looking at how all the staff travel to work and what the users of that site are putting in place to discourage car use. Would you agree with that?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No, I would not say it is just that. I would say it is part of it but a travel plan is much more detailed and much more a living document than as intimated there.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Yes, but in essence do you agree with the statement that the plan should be putting in place policy to discourage private car use?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It is part of it. Part of trying to get green accreditations and BREEAM accreditations for the building is to reduce the impact on the environment and part of reducing the impact on the environment is to reduce single-car usage.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

It is certainly about more environmentally-friendly alternatives one of which is to discourage people who drive alone and to take up more healthy options and public transport, et cetera. So there is a range of things, not just one thing.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I accept that. The Workplace Travel Plans Guide in the Island Plan says this: "Realistic targets for reductions in car use should be set and, if not met when part of a planning application, deemed to be a breach of that planning permission." You do accept that, yes?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Okay. Do you feel that helping to broker the site for an additional 45 car-parking spaces is in contravention of a travel plan?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

It depends on what the outcome of that travel plan is. If we manage to reduce the current 65 cars that are being used down to, say, 40 and, by being able to broker that down to that limit, facilitate 40 private spaces then I think you could argue that it is complimentary, depending on its context.

[15:30]

The Deputy of St. Martin:

But if those car-parking spaces are already in use by members of the public who are then displaced does that not effectively overcome the benefit environmentally?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

The spaces that you are referring to are not currently used by anybody else.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

So they are not currently used? They are currently car-parking spaces. The reason why I ask is because, in talking to the Minister for Planning and Environment, there is clearly an interaction

between the number of public car-parking spaces and the number of private car-parking spaces in town. If you allow more private spaces then you reduce demand. If you reduce private spaces you need to have more public spaces and we have got a threshold in the Island Plan of 4,000 public spaces. So it is a bit of a movable feast. We really wanted to get a better handle on this impact of your 40 private spaces bearing in mind that we know there is a very significant shortage of public car-parking for residents in that area and if that gets displaced it will have an effect. Ideally we would have liked to know more about this site that you ... It does seem to be quite a significant element of your case.

The Connétable of St. John:

Have the 40 spaces currently got cars on them or have they got to be created?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

They currently are not being used. I would like to pick up a point the Chairman made where he intimated that there is not sufficient resident parking in that area. Green Street Car Park overnight has 400 spare spaces in it. So overnight spaces in that area for residents, I would suggest there is ample.

Deputy J.H. Young:

The evidence we were told about La Route du Fort area is that obviously in all those streets around the Havre des Pas hinterland there is not sufficient spare space available to allow residents' parking schemes because the evidence is that for a residents' parking scheme to work there needs to be a pool of off-street spaces to allow that to happen. So it has not been possible in that area. What we also believe is, having visited La Route du Fort Car Park, that it is full up when people finish work. So while there are spaces in the day - weekday days, not weekends - it does fill up in the late afternoon/early evening as people come back from work to take those spaces. But the one thing we do not know is what the summer situation is there, i.e. when people are using the beach at Havre des Pas, whether they use that park. We do not know that.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I am led to believe that in the wintertime during the daytime hours there are 40 spaces available at La Route du Fort Car Park and in the summertime it tends to be about 20 spaces during the day.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Are you relying on those?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I should imagine that T.T.S. will have those plans.

The Connétable of St. John:

My turn, Minister, on these 40 spaces. Getting back to my original question, of the 40 spaces you identified which are not used have they in the past been permanent car-parking spaces? If they have not, have you got to make a planning application to get them used?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

As I said earlier, Constable, I do not want to say anything that breaches the confidence of the land owner.

The Connétable of St. John:

No, it has got nothing to do with the confidence of the land owner. The answer is you are either going to apply for planning or you are not for change of use of this land. It is a yes or a no answer. Are you applying to Planning for change of use of the land, yes or no?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

At this stage ...

The Connétable of St. John:

It is a yes or no answer, Minister.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

At this stage, prior to having ...

The Connétable of St. John:

I will take it as a no then.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

I think, Constable, you are not going to get an answer.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I think what we will record is the fact is you are not prepared to give us the full information because the land owner has put you under constraints.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I cannot say anything that would identify that site.

Deputy J.H. Young:

We have not been able to clear that up. Steve, could you ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Yes, I would like to change the subject if I could, please, Chairman. Assistant Minister, the Arup report has quite a lot of weight behind it when you come to quoting it. It is not clear who commissioned it. Could you tell us who paid for the report?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Yes.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Property Holdings.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Yes, of course. It is one of the consultant's reports. We commission them like we do consultants for a project: architects, Q.S. (quantity surveyor). They are a part of our engineering team.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Can I inquire as to how much it cost?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I could not tell you. I can let you know how much it cost. We have a fee agreement for consultants, which is based on a percentage of the capital cost. If it was identified separately I can certainly let you know.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

So it might be part of the capital costs of the police station project?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

No.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

A percentage of it?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Part of the fee costs of it. They are a subgroup of Arup, so we are doing the structural ...

The Deputy of St. Martin:

My final question would be, given that you have commissioned it and you have paid for the work, do you find a 54 per cent response an acceptable level on which to base your findings?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

I have had a chat through the architects with the engineer. Very often they work on 20 per cent responses for this sort of thing. Fifty-four per cent is phenomenally good and it makes the basis of the report very robust and the traffic engineer obviously had to look at that before he wrote his report.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Is there not a slim possibility that it might be a particular group of a particular type of transport user who just did not respond to this for a particular reason?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

Personally I think that is unlikely, but the margin of error is very slim and the advice I have been given is that 54 per cent is a phenomenally good response.

The Deputy of St. Martin:

Okay, thank you.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I think I am moving into the final round of subjects. Large operational vehicles, we understand that they are not going to be housed within the operational area within this building. Is there a need for those to access the police headquarters and how will they do so?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No, they are largely the R.M. sized vehicles. It is the command vehicles that are used for surveillance and that sort of thing. They are quite large. Thankfully they are rarely used but we have to have them. They would not go into the basement of the building. They would take up too much space and they can be garaged elsewhere. There is a proposal that we acquire some property nearby at La Collette, which is States-owned property, that we could rent to store our over-sized vehicles in a garaged facility.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is that a factory unit?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

It is a warehouse facility.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Is that commercially occupied?

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

It is about to be vacated.

Deputy J.H. Young:

So that reduces further the industrial ...

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

This is also linked to archive storage and things, which was always decided in 2009 to be offsite as well. So the 2 things would just come together as a happy coincidence.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Okay. Thank you for that. Just remind me, how many operational vehicles are you going to house in that building?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Five.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Only 5 operational vehicles?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Five over-sized vehicles. In the basement we have 42 plus motorcycles.

Deputy J.H. Young:

There will be no staff spaces in there?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No, purely for operational vehicles.

The Connétable of St. John:

Not including a chief officer's staff car or anything?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No. Staff car? Well, there is a patrol car.

The Connétable of St. John:

At the moment?

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Yes, at the moment.

The Connétable of St. John:

Because historically there were staff cars.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

Really? Officers will not have parking spaces there.

The Connétable of St. John:

I see. Can I come back on something you said earlier, Deputy Chief Officer? Financial Crimes Unit, I put the question to the Minister for Home Affairs and I was under the impression that that unit was staying at Summerland.

Deputy Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:

No, the whole site will be vacated. In fact they are going to be on the 2nd or 3rd floor, I think, of the proposed building.

The Connétable of St. John:

Okay. That is fine, thank you. I thought he may have been a bit confused.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I think we have covered the subject area we wanted to talk about. Assistant Minister, are there any other areas of traffic and transport that are in your head that the discussion we have had has not covered, traffic and parking?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

No. I am grateful that we have had the opportunity to come and help clarify matters. I know there were a few matters that were raised at your meetings last week and I am of the belief that none of the traffic issues that are current are show-stoppers for this particular development. I think all the issues can be worked round between outline planning and the police occupying the building. I think there is a solution to any of the problems that potentially are there.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Thank you for that, Assistant Minister. What we are obviously trying to do is to record what evidence we can identify to either demonstrate in favour of that or to the contrary. Before closing can I just ask you, you have obviously not been able to disclose to us publicly the information that you have about this alternative site. Would you be prepared to do so privately?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I would have to take some advice on that because I do not know the precise legal aspects of what undertaking was given with the land owner.

Assistant Director, Property Holdings:

He did not want the location to be revealed.

Deputy J.H. Young:

I think it is quite a significant element that it is part of your response to managing the parking that you have entered into those discussions. So in terms of determining the reliability I think it would be, we agree, very helpful to the panel to know that. So if you can take that away and let us know.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

We will take that away and we will discuss that with the land owner.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Also if we could see the transport survey I think you kindly provided. Is there anything else that we asked for? I think there was a letter from Planning where they said that they were prepared to act contrary to the Island Plan.

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

I have got 5 things that we have given an undertaking to provide you with. One is the exchange of emails between Property Holdings and the Planning Department about the travel plan; the pre-questionnaire documentation for a travel plan; the questionnaire, both the questions and the answers, that took place in October 2011; the cost of the Arup report if we can break that down; and the fifth undertaking is that we will go away and speak to the land owner to see if we can divulge the location to the Scrutiny Panel.

The Connétable of St. John:

Just before closing I will put the question once more re the planning. This 40 spaces, will you be required, yes or no, to get planning permission for change of use?

Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources:

Constable, I cannot answer that because in doing so I may or may not divulge the location of those spaces.

The Connétable of St. John:

Thank you.

Deputy J.H. Young:

Thank you, Assistant Minister. I will close the afternoon session. Thank you very much for your help to the panel and I will formally close the session.